

1 **Understanding ancient life: How Martin Brasier changed the way we think**
2 **about the fossil record**

3
4 Jonathan B. Antcliffe^{1,2*}, Alexander G. Liu³, Latha R. Menon⁴, Duncan McIlroy⁵, Nicola
5 McLoughlin⁶ & David Wacey^{3,7}

6
7 *1: Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, Tinbergen Building, South Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3PS, UK.*

8 *2: Oxford University Museum of Natural History, Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3PW, UK.*

9 *3: Department of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Life Sciences Building, 24 Tyndall Avenue, Bristol, BS8*
10 *1TQ, UK.*

11 *4: Department of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3AN, UK.*

12 *5: Department of Earth Sciences, Memorial University of Newfoundland, St John's, NL, A1B 3X5, Canada.*

13 *6: Department of Geology, Rhodes University, and the Albany Museum, Grahamstown, South Africa.*

14 *7: Centre for Microscopy, Characterisation and Analysis, The University of Western Australia, 35 Stirling*
15 *Highway, Perth, WA 6009, Australia.*

16
17 **Correspondence: jonathan.antcliffe@zoo.ox.ac.uk*

18
19 Critical to our understanding of life on Earth is the ability to judge the validity of claims of
20 very ancient ‘fossils’. Martin Brasier’s most important contribution to this debate was to
21 establish a framework within which to discuss claims of the ‘oldest’ life. In particular, Brasier
22 *et al.* (2002) made it clear that the burden of proof must fall on those making the claim of
23 ancient life, not those refuting it. This led to his formulation of the concept of the continuum
24 of morphologies produced by life and non-life, and the considerable challenges of
25 differentiating biogenesis from abiogenesis. Martin Brasier developed a set of criteria for
26 distinguishing life from non-life, and extended the use of many new high-resolution
27 analytical techniques to palaeontological research. He also applied this null hypothesis way
28 of thinking to the origin of animals and the Cambrian explosion (Brasier 2009), leading to
29 him being involved in the development of a series of nested null hypotheses, his “*cone of*
30 *contention*”, to analyse enigmatic fossils more generally. In short, Martin Brasier taught us

31 how to formulate biological hypotheses in deep time, established the rules for how those
32 hypotheses should be tested, and championed a host of novel analytical techniques to gather
33 the data required. As a consequence, future discussions of enigmatic specimens and very old
34 fossils will be greatly enriched by his contributions.

35

36 **Running Title:** Brasier fossil record

37

38 **Keywords:** ORIGIN OF LIFE–ORIGIN OF ANIMALS–NULL HYPOTHESIS–
39 PRECAMBRIAN EVOLUTION–MICROFOSSILS–TRACE FOSSILS–
40 STROMATOLITES–PSEUDOFOSILS–SELF ORGANISING STRUCTURES–
41 EDIACARAN BIOTA

42

43 Palaeontologists work on ancient organisms, and most have preferred organisms or groups of
44 organisms to which they dedicate their time, adding measurably to that area of knowledge.
45 But some palaeontologists do more than that. They survey the big picture. By considering the
46 interplay between palaeontological records and major geological and geochemical events,
47 and by identifying the overarching concepts and paradigms that govern biological evolution,
48 these researchers have significantly changed our perceptions of the fossil record, the history
49 of life, and evolution. For example, George Simpson opened our eyes to the pattern and
50 process paradox (Simpson 1944); Jack Sepkoski transformed our way of looking at the
51 diversity of life on Earth (Sepkoski 1981); Stephen Jay Gould changed how we look at the
52 complex interplay of ontogeny and phylogeny (Gould 1977); David Raup developed
53 innovative ways to measure morphology and reveal underlying evolutionary trends (Raup &
54 Michelson 1965); and Dolf Seilacher highlighted the patterns in animal behaviour that relate

55 to palaeoenvironmental parameters (Seilacher 1967). The many contributions of Martin
56 Brasier to understanding of the earliest fossil record sit well in this company. By defining
57 criteria for how to identify and analyse ancient fossils robustly, and providing state-of-the-art
58 data from numerous significant stratigraphic levels, Martin Brasier transformed two fields of
59 study: the origin of life, and the origin of animals. Below we outline the nature of his
60 contributions to palaeontological and evolutionary thinking.

61

62 **Early life and the null hypothesis**

63 Understanding major events in the history of life is one of the driving motivations of the
64 natural sciences, requiring the combination of a unique nexus of disciplines. The origin and
65 radiation of cellular structures in Archaean strata is pertinent to many branches of science,
66 from biology and palaeontology to planetary science and environmental geochemistry.

67 Attempts to identify the very earliest signs of life in ancient strata have stimulated biological
68 research into the genetic controls of cellular evolution (e.g., Cavalier-Smith 2006),
69 development of new geochemical proxies (e.g., Johnston 2011), and high-resolution
70 stratigraphy in deep time (e.g., Van Kranendonk 2012). Integration of findings from these
71 disciplines with evolutionary history requires confident identification of early cellular
72 structures, which is a challenging matter.

73

74 Cellular preservation in deep geological time has been recognised since the discovery of early
75 fossil biotas such as the 1.88 Ga Gunflint Chert (Tyler & Barghoorn 1954). There was a
76 natural expectation that older material would be found, and that scientists would be able to
77 repeatedly push the temporal boundaries for the history of life with new discoveries of well-
78 preserved cellular structures (Hofmann 1976; Schopf 1992, 1993). In the very earliest parts of

79 the stratigraphic record, however, as it becomes increasingly improbable that older fossils
80 will be found, testing and falsifying a null hypothesis of abiogenesis is required before any
81 putative sign of life can be confirmed.

82

83 Critical to our understanding of life on Earth is the ability to judge the validity of claims of
84 very ancient fossils. Structures reported from the Apex Chert (3.46 Ga) that were interpreted
85 to occur in sedimentary rocks and be biological in origin (Schopf & Packer, 1987; Schopf,
86 1992, 1993) were considered compelling candidates for the earliest fossils in publications
87 throughout the 1990s. Martin Brasier's most important contribution to this debate was to
88 characterize those structures in great detail, and also to develop a framework within which
89 claims of the 'oldest' or 'earliest' life should be couched. In his lectures on this subject,
90 Martin referred to the competitive tendency among palaeontologists working on early life as
91 the 'MOFAOTYOF' Principle – *My Oldest Fossils Are Older Than Your Oldest Fossils*. In
92 particular, Brasier *et al.* (2002) made it clear that the burden of proof must fall on those
93 making the claim of ancient life, not those refuting it:

94 *“Ancient filamentous structures should not be accepted as being of biological origin*
95 *until all possibilities of their non-biological origin have been exhausted. In particular,*
96 *it is important to note that complex 'septate' carbonaceous structures can result from*
97 *experimental hydrothermal processes”* (Brasier *et al.* 2002, p. 80).

98

99 In other words, we should assume that ancient structures resembling fossils such as those in
100 the Apex Chert are abiological until it can be shown beyond reasonable doubt that they are
101 not; rather than the other way around. Brasier (2015) articulates this concept clearly:

102 *“This ... allows palaeobiologists to set up a hypothesis which will prevail until proved*
103 *false..... Any newsworthy, and culturally challenging, interpretation must therefore be*
104 *tested against a less exciting interpretation. This ‘null hypothesis’ is usually regarded*
105 *as the ‘most boring explanation’. It is boring precisely because it is thought to have a*
106 *higher probability of being correct.”* Brasier (2015, p. 9)

107

108 This could be thought of as Brasier’s razor: “the most boring answer is probably the correct
109 one”. This approach also raises the question of what comprises ‘reasonable doubt’, especially
110 in the adversarial world of academia, and how the probability of a structure being biogenic
111 might be assessed. Martin therefore developed a set of rigorously defined criteria to describe
112 the conditions that must be satisfied, and the evidence required, to reject a null hypothesis of
113 abiogenesis and accept a structure as being reasonable evidence for early life. This approach
114 forces subjective debate to be replaced by objective assessment of whether or not biogenicity
115 criteria are met in any putative fossil under consideration. Further, there is clearly a temporal
116 consideration, with the probability of finding fossilised bacterial life (for example) much
117 more likely and less controversial (and therefore less newsworthy) by the time there are, for
118 instance, abundant trilobites (500 Ma ago) than in very early sediments (3500 Ma ago) when
119 the existence and nature of life is still much debated (Fig. 1). Indeed Brasier (2015) adds that:

120 *“For biomorphs older than 3.0 Ga, it seems prudent not to accept them as biogenic*
121 *until plausible abiogenic origins have been tested and falsified”* (Brasier 2015, p. 10)

122

123 This does not mean that putative fossils younger than 3.0 Ga should be treated with less
124 scrutiny than those 3.0 Ga or older. Rather, it means that the older the fossils, the more likely
125 they are to be significant, and this should encourage our scepticism. Palaeontologists in the
126 1970’s were the first to caution on the problem of correctly determining the biogenicity and

127 syngenicity of Precambrian microfossils (Schopf, 1975; Cloud, 1976) and this led to
128 significant advances in developing sets of criteria in an attempt to minimise erroneous
129 interpretations (Schopf & Walter 1983; Buick 1990).

130

131 Brasier's application of the concept of the null hypothesis in palaeobiology, to understand the
132 earliest fossil record, ushered in a paradigm shift in how palaeontologists think about the
133 evidence for the earliest life, towards a norm in which scepticism rather than credulity holds
134 the high ground. It is a mind-set that is entirely in keeping with Martin's own scientific
135 outlook. He described the fossil record as being akin to a card game in which the players are
136 not told the rules (Brasier 2009). It was important, in his view, to question assumptions, to
137 consider how we look at the fossil record, and determine whether we are asking the right
138 questions:

139 *“Human progress towards learning the rules for decoding the fossil record has...been*
140 *slow, requiring trial and error, with lots of questions, intuition and counter-intuition,*
141 *accompanied by oceans of doubt. But then, science, which always rejoices in a good*
142 *question, is a unique system for the measurement of doubt” (Brasier 2009, p. 34).*

143

144 **Distinguishing between biological and abiological**

145 Martin's next step in developing the tools to search for early life was to step away from the
146 world of fossils, and examine in detail abiological structures that could appear to be
147 biological in origin, and then tackle the important question of how to distinguish the two (Fig.
148 2). The recognition that biological products can be very difficult to distinguish from those of
149 physical processes was in itself a critical development since many of the old assumptions
150 regarding 'search criteria' for early life did not yield unique solutions:

151 “...reports of early microfossils and stromatolites (e.g. Hofmann et al. 1999) are not
152 readily distinguishable from self organizing structures (SOS) and have yet to pass the
153 null hypothesis, that microfossil- and stromatolite-like structures ... should not be
154 accepted as of biological origin until alternative hypotheses for their abiogenic origin
155 have been tested and falsified” (Brasier et al. 2006, p. 887).

156

157 He emphasized that, particularly at the interface of competing physical parameters,
158 abiological processes are capable of generating a great range of complex, including self-
159 organising, structures that can appear remarkably biological (Fig. 2). Awareness of this often
160 close similarity between morphologies produced by organisms and abiological physico-
161 chemical processes is important for palaeontologists trying to interpret the Precambrian fossil
162 record.

163 “Unfortunately, complex structures do not require complex causes, as shown nearly a
164 century ago by Thompson (1917). They can arise naturally in physico-chemical systems
165 within the realms of ‘chaotic’ behaviour as Grotzinger & Rothman (1996) showed a
166 decade ago with reference to stromatolites... we draw attention to a range of physico-
167 chemical gradients that can lead to the formation of macroscopic stromatoloids (figure
168 2a) and ripples (b) as well as to microfossil-like structures generated by the growth of
169 dendrites (e), ... polygonal crystal rims (g) and spherulites (h)” (Brasier et al. 2006, fig.
170 2 and p. 889).

171

172 An enormous range of abiogenic phenomena, including dendrite growth, mixed fluids and
173 wave fronts, can produce complex structures. An informative example comes from what is
174 now widely known as the “paint stromatolite” (McLoughlin et al. 2008). This series of
175 experiments, inspired by structures observed at the Mini car factory outside Oxford, showed

176 that it was possible to generate stromatolitic deposits, including some morphologies
177 previously considered to be strong indicators of microbial sedimentary activity (e.g. Buick *et*
178 *al.* 1981), in the complete absence of microbial growth. It is clear that microbes can build the
179 complex morphological structures known as stromatolites through trapping and binding of
180 sediment, phototaxis, and microbially mediated chemical precipitation. However, non-
181 isopachous, wrinkled, and convex upward laminae (Buick *et al.* 1981) can form due to
182 variations in flux rate and viscosity of a flowing colloid (McLoughlin *et al.* 2008). These
183 experiments (McLoughlin *et al.* 2008) demonstrate that colloidal substances (e.g. fine clay
184 particles suspended in sea water; also silica sinters deposited from the vapour phase and in
185 splash zones) can accrete on a substrate to form morphologies previously considered to be
186 biogenic.

187

188 Large negative carbon isotope fractionations have also been interpreted as a signature of early
189 life (e.g. Schidlowski 2001). However, Martin Brasier emphasized that context is particularly
190 crucial for isotopic fractionations, which by their very nature must be reported relative to a
191 large terrestrial reservoir, typically the ocean, and with consideration of the processes likely
192 to operate in the environment in which they are found (e.g., fluid-rock interactions). The
193 magnitude of an isotope fractionation alone is not sufficient evidence of biogenicity, and
194 must rather be interpreted in terms of its environmental setting, and this is often where
195 isotopic claims of life from the very early Earth break down (e.g. Mojzsis *et al.* 1996; Bell *et*
196 *al.* 2015). A number of abiological processes (e.g., atmospheric and hydrothermal synthesis
197 of organic material, or processes such as Fischer-Tropsch synthesis) may also result in carbon
198 isotope fractionations comparable to those of metabolic processes (Horita 2005). The
199 products of such abiological processes were arguably more prevalent on the early Earth than

200 the products of metabolism, therefore understanding these data in their correct geological
201 context is critical:

202 *“isotopically light carbonaceous matter, preserved largely in silica-rich chert, was not*
203 *only widespread in [Archaean] surface environments, but also intimately connected to*
204 *numerous, deep hydrothermal dyke systems”* (Brasier *et al.* 2006, p. 887).

205

206 Faced with this continuum of morphologies produced by life and non-life, and the
207 considerable challenges of differentiating biology from abiology, Martin actively explored
208 new criteria and approaches to identifying robust traces of life in the early rock record, and
209 even on other planets. Much of his work subsequent to that on the Apex Chert was towards
210 developing so called “lifelines” or “biosignals” for seeking the earliest traces of life in the
211 rock record, and also the earliest evidence of animals in the late Precambrian.

212

213 **Extrapolation to the extraterrestrial**

214 Martin Brasier strongly advocated that the search for life beyond Earth needed to take
215 account of data generated by studying the earliest putative evidence of life on Earth, and that
216 the Archaean was our testing ground for developing tools and approaches to seeking extra-
217 terrestrial life. Martin first engaged with the field of astrobiology as a micropalaeontologist
218 considering the Mars microfossil debate in the late 1990s, and also as an Earth systems
219 scientist who sought to consider the interaction of life with the surrounding planetary system.
220 He urged extreme caution, arguing that the abiogenic null hypothesis must be our starting
221 point for exploring other planetary surfaces, with the assumption that all candidate
222 biosignatures are abiotic (Brasier *et al.* 2004).

223

224 In a series of papers, Martin and colleagues proposed criteria for evaluating potential traces
225 of life beyond Earth, drawing upon experience of working on Precambrian biota in particular.
226 For example, Brasier *et al.* (2004) critically reviewed the biogenicity criteria applied at that
227 time by the palaeontological community, and argued that they were inadequate for evaluating
228 the Apex Chert microtextures. This was followed by further papers offering additional
229 refined biogenicity criteria for both: 1) carbonaceous microfossils (e.g. Brasier *et al.* 2006;
230 Brasier & Wacey 2012); and 2) endolithic microborings, i.e., microtunnels made by rock-
231 boring microbes in substrates including carbonates, siliciclastic grains, and volcanic glass that
232 could one-day provide textural evidence of a subsurface biosphere on Mars (McLoughlin *et*
233 *al.* 2007). In one of his last astrobiological contributions, Martin stated:

234 *“... no unusual claim for life from a very remote time period, or from a very remote*
235 *place, should be accepted by the scientific community unless it forms part of a natural*
236 *population of structures that can be systematically studied. These populations will then*
237 *need to be placed within an appropriate morphospace, and shown to be distinct in*
238 *character from any abiogenic mimics that might be expected to occur within the same*
239 *kind of setting” (Brasier & Wacey 2012, p. 221)*

240

241 **The importance of multiple lines of evidence**

242 Biogenicity criteria have existed in one form or another for a number of decades, with those
243 advanced by Schopf & Walter (1983) most frequently cited by studies in the 1980s and
244 1990s. While such criteria were rigorously applied in the years soon after their development,
245 over time they rather slipped from view and a certain amount of complacency regarding
246 Precambrian life set in. In addition, twenty years of technological advances meant that there
247 was an opportunity to build upon the early work of Schopf, Walter and others, and refine and

248 update these criteria. Martin re-invigorated this line of investigation championing the use of
249 multiple lines of evidence in order to uphold or falsify the null hypothesis of abiogenicity:

250 “.....we suggest that the testing of biological signals in very ancient rocks address
251 three main criteria: geological context, biology-like morphology and biology-like
252 processing” (Brasier *et al.* 2005, p. 80).

253

254 Fulfilling the criterion of a geological context plausible for life has been shown to require
255 geological and fabric mapping at a variety of scales, from kilometres to nanometres. Martin’s
256 detailed field mapping of the 3.46 Ga Apex Chert around Chinaman Creek, building on that
257 of Van Kranendonk and others (e.g., Van Kranendonk *et al.* 2001), demonstrated that the
258 putative microfossils in this unit were not within a detrital component of bedded chert
259 (Schopf 1993):

260 “Mapping.... shows that putative ‘microfossil’-bearing clasts were formed by
261 fracturing and pulverization of earlier fissure-filling deposits and chert, and
262 consistent with formation as hydrobreccia under hydrothermal conditions” (Brasier *et*
263 *al.* 2005, p. 81).

264

265 Petrographic mapping of host rock and carbonaceous microfabrics was also central to the
266 approach, and was often the primary observation that would lead to additional analyses of
267 geochemical or quantitative morphological data. In the case of the Apex Chert microtextures,
268 it was detailed petrographic re-investigation of the chert microfabrics that led to the first
269 doubt over the biological nature of the microfossils (Brasier *et al.* 2002, 2011). Petrographic
270 observations were used to develop an abiotic framework for the microtextures observed, and
271 to propose a model in which the size, shape and spectrum of morphologies could be related to

272 the diameter of the silica spherulites and the concentration of impurities in the chert (Brasier
273 *et al.* 2005).

274

275 Fulfilling the criteria of biology-like morphology requires more than simple morphological
276 comparison to younger fossil or extant bacteria. Martin advocated the exploration of potential
277 morphospace; i.e., size- and shape-independent mapping of morphology both within
278 microfossils and between them. For example, in well-preserved microfossil assemblages,
279 Martin argued that morphological variation within natural populations is usually less than that
280 of comparable abiological structures, and they will therefore occupy a more restricted
281 morphospace (Brasier *et al.* 2006). There is evidence to support such a view, given that the
282 standard deviation of ‘filament’ widths is larger for the abiogenic Apex Chert structures when
283 compared, for example, with the biogenic Gunflint Chert assemblage (Brasier *et al.* 2006).
284 Additional information may also come from mapping the areal distribution of putative
285 microfossil filaments. For instance, ‘clusters’ of filaments that overlap and intertwine are
286 common for microbial communities (e.g. Gunflint Chert) but seem to be rare or lacking in
287 abiogenic assemblages (e.g. Apex Chert). In the case of microtextures from the 3.4 Ga
288 Strelley Pool Formation, additional morphological support for biogenicity was identified:

289 *“The microstructures we identify exhibit indicators of biological affinity, including*
290 *hollow cell lumens, carbonaceous cell walls enriched in nitrogen, taphonomic*
291 *degradation, organization into chains and clusters...”* (Wacey *et al.* 2011 p. 698).

292

293 Addressing the criterion of “biology-like processing”, Martin sought evidence for the
294 preservation of ‘zones’ of microbial processing, and/or evidence for microbial tiering within
295 ecosystems. By this he meant geochemical or morphological evidence for microbial

296 stratification within the putative fossil remains, or evidence for microbial processing by
297 heterotrophs. For example, in the Strelley Pool Formation, occurrence of micron-sized pyrite
298 grains within and around partially degraded carbonaceous cell walls provides evidence for
299 microbial processing by heterotrophic sulfate-reducing bacteria (Wacey *et al.* 2011). This
300 pattern has since been replicated in other younger Precambrian microfossil assemblages (e.g.
301 1.88 Ga Gunflint Formation; Wacey *et al.* 2013).

302

303 Rigorous testing of these criteria of course requires the correct materials and analytical
304 techniques:

305 *“While the quality of the early fossil record is much better than Darwin might ever*
306 *have dared to imagine, we must still map out its limits, and push back the boundaries*
307 *using new techniques to test out ideas both new and old”* (Brasier *et al.* 2015, p.
308 4864)

309

310 Martin was quick to recognise opportunities for new technologies to enhance our
311 understanding of the fossil record, while at the same time realising that a single technique
312 could not deliver the ‘smoking gun’ of unambiguous evidence for early life (Fig. 3). He was
313 one of the first to apply laser Raman micro-spectroscopy to characterize the structure of
314 Archaean carbon, and one of the first to caution its limitations (Brasier *et al.* 2002; Pasteris &
315 Wopenka 2003). Around this time he was also bringing computer aided ‘automontage’ to the
316 attention of Precambrian palaeontologists, enabling an improved visualisation of three-
317 dimensional structures within thin sections. Notably, this was used to show that some
318 putative microfossils in the Apex Chert were branched, a feature incompatible with very
319 primitive bacteria (Fig. 3a; see also Brasier *et al.* 2002, 2005).

320

321 Martin also championed the use of NanoSIMS (nano-scale secondary ion mass spectrometry)
322 in palaeobiology (Wacey *et al.* 2008), recognising that this technique uniquely combined very
323 high spatial resolution (~50 nm) with excellent sensitivity for those light elements and
324 isotopes typical of cellular material and biominerals (e.g. C, N, S, O, P; Wacey *et al.* 2011).
325 More recently, Martin provided the impetus for the development of protocols to analyse
326 putative microfossils in both two and three dimensions at the sub-micrometre scale, using
327 techniques such as TEM (transmission electron microscopy) and FIB-SEM (focused ion
328 beam milling combined with scanning electron microscopy) (Wacey *et al.* 2012, 2015;
329 Brasier *et al.* 2015). These high spatial resolution techniques, combined with careful fabric
330 and morphological mapping, all considered in the context of a well understood geological
331 setting, are now providing greater confidence that ancient life can be accurately distinguished
332 from abiological artefacts (Brasier *et al.* 2015). Notably, this approach has recently dispelled
333 the notion that cell lumina are present in Apex ‘microfossils’ (Fig. 3b-f), instead:

334 “....carbon is seen wrapped around the margins of the vermiform phyllosilicate–
335 quartz grain boundaries, and is interleaved between vermiform phyllosilicate grains
336 in pseudofossil interiors, along grain boundaries, and along triple junctions of quartz
337 exterior to the pseudofossils” (Brasier *et al.* 2015 p. 4862).

338

339 Such data are also providing unique insights into the younger Precambrian fossil record,
340 revealing for example the 3D organisation of the problematical microfossil *Eosphaera tyleri*,
341 and evidence for heterotrophic degradation by sulfate reducing bacteria of *Gunflintia* sheaths,
342 both from the 1.88 Ga Gunflint Chert (Wacey *et al.* 2013; Brasier *et al.* 2015).

343

344 Once liberated by these rigorous approaches Martin Brasier sought to go off the well-worn
345 path in search of new evidence for early life.

346 *“There are also new places to look in the fossil record, so that environments long*
347 *assumed to be barren of life may yet prove to be teeming”* (Brasier *et al.* 2015 p.
348 4864)

349

350 A classic example of this was moving the search for cellular preservation away from cherts
351 and towards other rock types in Archaean cratons. This resulted in the discovery of
352 carbonaceous cells and sheaths preserved in pore space cements of a 3.43 Ga placer-type
353 sandstone (Wacey *et al.* 2011, 2012; Brasier *et al.* 2015). These sorts of results show just how
354 important it is to continually test received wisdom, to refine search criteria, and to look for
355 new ways to analyse old problems.

356

357 **Developing a generalised null hypothesis**

358 Guided by a null hypothesis in assessing evidence of early life, and armed with a set of
359 rigorous criteria for distinguishing pseudo-fossils from the real thing, Martin applied this way
360 of thinking to other major transitions in the history of life, including the origin of the
361 eukaryotic cell (Brasier 2012), and the origin of animals and the Cambrian explosion of
362 complex animal life (Brasier 2009). Palaeontologists working on the origin of animals face
363 similar problems to those working on the earliest life, since putative early animal fossils are
364 often difficult to recognise, may possess few diagnostic characters, and are typically found in
365 environments with complex and non-uniformitarian geological and taphonomic histories.
366 Many candidate early animal fossils are controversial, with multiple competing hypotheses to
367 explain how they relate to modern organisms. When calibrated against an absolute timescale,

368 it is clear that claims for the earliest animals based on very controversial fossils (Seilacher et
369 al 1998) exceed double the length of the whole known certain fossil record of animals (Fig.
370 1). The same is true for single celled eukaryotes (Fig. 1). It is therefore extremely important
371 to determine what is certain to be true and can form the basis of a null hypothesis, from that
372 which is merely possibly true, when trying to understand the fossil record. This line of
373 thinking is evident in extensive reassessment of the sponge fossil record (Antcliffe *et al.*
374 2014), which retracted previous claims Martin had made about the oldest known sponge
375 spicules in the late Ediacaran of Mongolia (Brasier *et al.* 1997). He was fond of saying that
376 this was his own MOFAOTYOF principle moment, which was particularly sobering because
377 Brasier *et al.* (1997) was one his most highly cited works.

378

379 Throughout the Precambrian there is a general trend of increasing morphological complexity
380 in documented fossils (Knoll *et al.* 2006). However, as with simpler forms, Martin
381 championed the importance of maintaining an abiogenic “starting question” where the burden
382 of proof is on proving the presence of life. If an abiogenic origin can first be rejected, then a
383 prokaryotic affinity becomes the working model, with efforts progressively focused towards
384 demonstrating a higher (eukaryotic) affinity and then a multicellular eukaryotic affinity (Fig.
385 4; Antcliffe & McLoughlin 2008; Brasier 2015).

386 *“Where biogenicity of early fossils is less in question, the chosen null hypothesis may*
387 *then move upwards along a conceptual ‘cone of contention’ ... Such a framework*
388 *requires the rejection of prokaryote (e.g. bacterial) affinities in the first place, and then*
389 *of simple eukaryote (e.g. protozoan and algal) affinities, before moving towards*
390 *acceptance of the much sought-after but highly controversial category of early*
391 *metazoan.”* Brasier (2015, p.10; see also Fig. 4 herein).

392

393 The Ediacaran fossil *Charnia*, known from sections in U.K., Canada, Australia and Russia
394 (e.g. Brasier *et al.* 2012), provides a good example (Figs 4–5). It is clearly not abiogenic
395 because of its consistent morphology across a variety of facies, environments and taphonomic
396 regimes. The maximum size that *Charnia* can achieve—approaching one metre in length—
397 makes a prokaryote affinity impossible given the consistent, replicated morphology that is not
398 facies controlled as it is for prokaryotic colonies such as stromatolites (Bertrand-Sarfati
399 1994). If we accept that *Charnia* has a growth programme more complex than anything a
400 prokaryote is known to achieve, then it is possible to reject the hypothesis of prokaryote
401 affinity and move on to the single celled eukaryote hypothesis. For *Charnia* the eukaryotic
402 null hypothesis (colonial or otherwise) proves very difficult to overcome, and no one has yet
403 demonstrated any compelling case to move beyond it to eukaryotic organisms with true
404 multi-cellularity, since there remains a large number of plausible eukaryotic clades that could
405 form such morphologies (Antcliffe & Hancy 2013). In this way, fossil morphology can be
406 interpreted by the iterative application of the null hypothesis, a process that represents a
407 theoretical structure within which to consider the affinities of any given fossil. It is a
408 powerful approach that can and should be applied to any fossil in deep time, which highlights
409 the limits of our certainty, and the point beyond which we would be breaking ‘Brasier’s
410 razor’.

411

412 CONCLUSIONS

413 The use of a null hypothesis for analysing complex problems is standard practice across the
414 biological sciences. The work of Martin Brasier, particularly through publications concerning
415 the earliest evidence of life on Earth (Brasier *et al.* 2002, 2006; Brasier 2015), formulated
416 rigorous hypotheses concerning Precambrian palaeontology and showed how they could help
417 us understand major events in the history of life.

418

419 To test palaeontological hypotheses one must have a series of criteria for the robust
420 identification and analysis of ancient fossils. A palaeontologist must then test for these
421 criteria in candidate fossils using all available investigative techniques to gather data. Martin
422 Brasier developed guidelines for how palaeontological hypotheses should be tested in the
423 Precambrian and in the search for extra-terrestrial life, and in doing so championed the use of
424 many novel analytical techniques to gather the necessary data. Every enigmatic or
425 contentious fossil can be approached in this way.

426

427 Martin's rigorous emphasis on application of the null hypothesis and cautious interpretation
428 of ancient fossils went hand in hand with a freedom of thought, and a readiness to explore
429 possibilities that led to creative new approaches to questions such as the environments in
430 which we should seek evidence for the earliest life. Martin Brasier was hugely optimistic
431 about what else we may yet find:

432 *“Early geologists like James Hutton (1790) famously reported finding ‘no vestige of a*
433 *beginning’. In recent years, however, we have begun to obtain a much better*
434 *understanding of the early Earth.... we may perceive a ‘vestige of a beginning’,*
435 *but there is ‘no prospect of an end’, as yet, in terms of improving our understanding*
436 *of the nature and evolution of the early biosphere.” Brasier et al. 2006.*

437

438 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

439 JBA thanks the ongoing support of Oxford University's Museum of Natural History and Department
440 of Zoology. DW was funded by the European Commission and the Australian Research Council
441 (FT140100321). AGL is supported by the Natural Environment Research Council [grant number

442 NE/L011409/1]. NM is supported by the Centre for Excellence in Palaeosciences at the
 443 University of Witwatersrand and Rhodes University, South Africa. DMc is supported by an
 444 NSERC DG award.

445

446 **REFERENCES**

447 Antcliffe, J.B. & Brasier, M.D. 2007. *Charnia* and seapens are poles apart. *Journal of the*
 448 *Geological Society of London*, **164**, 49-52.

449

450 Antcliffe, J.B. & Hancy, A.D. 2013. Critical questions about early character acquisition.
 451 *Evolution and Development*, **15**, 225-227.

452

453 Antcliffe, J.B. & McLoughlin, N. 2008. Deciphering fossil evidence for the origin of life and
 454 the origin of animals. In: Seckbach, J. & Walsh, M. (eds) *From Fossils to Astrobiology-*
 455 *Records of Life on Earth and the Search for Extraterrestrial Biosignatures*. Springer,
 456 Netherlands, 211-229.

457

458 Antcliffe, J.B., Callow, R.H.T. & Brasier, M.D. 2014. Giving the early fossil record of
 459 sponges a squeeze. *Biological Reviews*, **89**, 972-1004.

460

461 Bailey, J.V., Joye, S.B., Kalanetra, K.M., Flood, B.E. & Corsetti, F.A. 2007. Evidence of
 462 giant sulfur bacteria in Neoproterozoic phosphorites. *Nature*, **445**, 198-201.

463

464 Barghoorn, E.S. & Tyler, S.A. 1965. Microorganisms from the Gunflint Chert. *Science*, **147**,
 465 563-577.

466

467 Bell, E.A., Boehnke, P., Harrison, T.M. & Mao, W.L. 2015. Potentially biogenic carbon
 468 preserved in a 4.1 billion-year-old zircon. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*
 469 *Sciences USA*, **112**, 14518-14521.

470

471 Bengtson, S., Cunningham, J.A., Yin, C. & Donoghue, P.C.J. 2012. A merciful death for the
 472 'earliest bilaterian' Veranimalcula. *Evolution & Development*, **14**, 421-427.

473

474 Bertrand-Sarfati, J. 1994. Siliciclastic-carbonate stromatolite domes in the Early
 475 Carboniferous of the Ajjers Basin (eastern Sahara, Algeria). In: Bertrand-Sarfati, J. &
 476 Monty, C. (eds) *Phanerozoic Stromatolites II*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht,
 477 395-419

478

479 Brasier, M.D. 2009. *Darwin's Lost World: The Hidden History of Animal Life*. Oxford
 480 University Press.

481

482 Brasier, M.D. 2015. Deep questions about the nature of early-life signals: a commentary on
 483 Lister (1673) 'A description of certain stones figured like plants'. *Philosophical*
 484 *Transactions of the Royal Society (A)*, **373**, DOI: 10.1098/rsta.2014.0254

485

- 486 Brasier, M.D. & Antcliffe, J.B. 2004. Decoding the Ediacaran enigma. *Science*, **305**, 1115-
487 1117.
- 488
- 489 Brasier, M.D. & Antcliffe, J.B. 2009. Evolutionary relationships within the Avalonian
490 Ediacara biota: new insights from laser analysis. *Journal of the Geological Society*,
491 **166**, 363-384.
- 492
- 493 Brasier, M.D., Green, O. & Shields, G. 1997. Ediacaran sponge spicule clusters from
494 southwestern Mongolia and the origins of the Cambrian fauna. *Geology*, **25**, 303-306.
- 495
- 496 Brasier, M.D., Green, O.R., Jephcoat, A.P., Kleppe, A.K., van Kranendonk, M.J., Lindsay,
497 J.F., Steele, A. & Grassineau, N.V. 2002. Questioning the evidence for Earth's oldest
498 fossils. *Nature*, **416**, 76-81.
- 499
- 500 Brasier, M.D., Green, O.R. & McLoughlin N. 2004. Characterization and critical testing of
501 potential microfossils from the early Earth: the Apex 'microfossil debate' and its
502 lessons for Mars sample return. *International Journal of Astrobiology*, **3**, 139-150.
- 503
- 504 Brasier, M.D., Green, O.R., Lindsay, J.F., McLoughlin, N., Steele, A. & Stoakes, C. 2005.
505 Critical testing of Earth's oldest putative fossil assemblage from the ~3.5 Ga Apex
506 chert, Chinaman Creek, Western Australia. *Precambrian Research*, **140**, 55-102.
- 507
- 508 Brasier, M.D., McLoughlin, N., Green, O.R. & Wacey, D. 2006. A fresh look at the fossil
509 evidence for early Archaean cellular life. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal
510 Society (B)*, **361**, 887-902.
- 511
- 512
- 513 Brasier, M.D., Green, O.R., Lindsay, J.F., McLoughlin, N., Stoakes, C., Brasier, A. &
514 Wacey, D. 2011. Geology and putative microfossil assemblage of the c. 3460 Ma
515 'Apex chert', Chinaman Creek, Western Australia – a field and petrographic guide.
516 *Geological Survey of Western Australia Record*, **2011/7**, 60p.
- 517
- 518 Brasier, M.D. & Wacey, D. 2012. Fossils and astrobiology: new protocols for cell evolution
519 in deep time. *International Journal of Astrobiology*, **11**, 217-228.
- 520
- 521 Brasier, M.D., Antcliffe, J.B. & Liu, A.G. 2012. The architecture of Ediacaran fronds.
522 *Palaeontology*, **55**, 1105-1124.
- 523
- 524 Brasier, M.D., Antcliffe, J.B., Saunders, M. & Wacey, D. 2015. Changing the picture of
525 Earth's earliest fossils (3.5-1.9 Ga) with new approaches and new discoveries.
526 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA*, **112**, 4859-4864.
- 527
- 528 Buick, R. 1990. Microfossil recognition in Archaean rocks: an appraisal of spheroids and
529 filaments from 3500 MY old chert-barite at North Pole, Western Australia. *Palaaios*, **5**,
530 441-459.
- 531
- 532 Buick, R., Dunlop, J.S.R. & Groves, D.I. 1981. Stromatolite recognition in ancient rocks: an
533 appraisal of irregularly laminated structures in an early Archaean chert-barite unit from
534 North Pole, western Australia. *Alcheringa*, **5**, 161-181.
- 535

- 536 Cavalier-Smith, T. 2006. Cell evolution and Earth history: stasis and revolution.
537 *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society (B)*, **361**, 969-1006.
538
- 539 Cloud, P. 1976. Beginnings of biospheric evolution and their biogeochemical consequences.
540 *Paleobiology*, **2**, 351-387.
541
- 542 Gould, S.J. 1977. *Ontogeny and Phylogeny*. Cambridge, Massachusetts, The Belknap Press of
543 Harvard University Press.
544
- 545 Grotzinger, J.P. & Rothman, D.H. 1996. An abiotic model for stromatolite morphogenesis.
546 *Nature*, **383**, 423-425.
547
- 548 Hofmann, H.J. 1972. Precambrian remains in Canada: fossils, dubiofossils, and
549 pseudofossils. *In: International Geological Congress, 24th Session, Proceedings,*
550 *Montreal, 20-30.*
551
- 552 Hofmann, H.J. 1976. Precambrian microflora, Belcher Islands, Canada: significance and
553 systematics. *Journal of Paleontology*, **50**, 1040-1073.
554
- 555 Hofmann, H.J., Grey, K., Hickman, A.H. & Thorpe, R.I. 1999. Origin of 3.45 Ga coniform
556 stromatolites in Warrawoona Group, Western Australia. *Geological Society of America*
557 *Bulletin*, **111**, 1256-1262.
558
- 559 Horita, J. 2005. Some perspectives on isotope biosignatures for early life. *Chemical Geology*,
560 **218**, 171-186.
561
- 562 Johnston, D.T. 2011. Multiple sulfur isotopes and the evolution of Earth's surface sulfur
563 cycle. *Earth-Science Reviews*, **106**, 161-183.
564
- 565 Kazmierczak, J. 1979. The eukaryotic nature of Eosphaera-like ferriferous structures from the
566 Precambrian Gunflint Iron Formation, Canada: a comparative study. *Precambrian*
567 *Research*, **9**, 1-22.
568
- 569 Knoll, A.H., Javaux, E.J., Hewitt, D. & Cohen, P. 2006. Eukaryotic organisms in Proterozoic
570 oceans. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B*, **361**, 1023-1038.
571
- 572 Lister, M. 1673. A description of certain stones figured like plants, and by some observing
573 men esteemed to be plants petrified. *Philosophical Transactions*, **8**, 6181-6191.
574
- 575 McKay, D.S., Gibson Jr., E.K., Thomas-Keprta, K.L., Vali, H., Romanek, C.S., Clemett, S.J.,
576 Chillier, X.D.F., Maechling, C.R. & Zare, R.N. 1996. Search for past life on Mars:
577 possible relic biogenic activity in Martian meteorite ALH84001. *Science*, **273**, 924-930.
578
- 579 McLoughlin, N., Brasier, M.D., Perry, R.S., Wacey, D. & Green, O.R. 2007. On biogenicity
580 criteria for endolithic microborings on early Earth and beyond. *Astrobiology* **7**, 10-11.
581
- 582 McLoughlin, N., Wilson, L.A. & Brasier, M.D. 2008. Growth of synthetic stromatolites and
583 wrinkle structures in the absence of microbes—implications for the early fossil record.
584 *Geobiology*, **6**, 95-105.
585

- 586 Mojzsis, S.J., Arrenhius, G., McKeegan, K.D., Harrison, T.M., Nutman, A.P. & Friend,
587 C.R.L. 1996. Evidence for life on Earth 3,800 million years ago. *Nature*, **384**, 55-59.
588
- 589 Pasteris, J.D. & Wopenka, B. 2003. Necessary, but not sufficient: Raman identification of
590 disordered carbon as a signature of ancient life. *Astrobiology*, **3**, 727-738.
591
- 592 Raup, D.M. & Michelson, A. 1965. Theoretical morphology of the coiled shell. *Science*, **147**,
593 1294-1295.
594
- 595 Schidlowski, M. 2001. Carbon isotopes as biogeochemical recorders of life over 3.8 Ga of
596 Earth history: evolution of a concept. *Precambrian Research*, **106**, 117-134.
597
- 598 Schopf, J.W. 1975. Precambrian paleobiology: problems and perspectives. *Annual Review of*
599 *Earth & Planetary Science*, **3**, 213-249.
600
- 601 Schopf, J.W. 1992. Palaeobiology in the Archean. In: Schopf, J. W. & Klein, C. (eds) *The*
602 *Proterozoic Biosphere: A Multidisciplinary Study*, Cambridge University Press, 25-39.
603
- 604 Schopf, J.W. 1993. Microfossils of the Early Archean Apex Chert: new evidence of the
605 antiquity of life. *Science*, **260**, 640-646.
606
- 607 Schopf, J.W. 1999. *Cradle of Life. The Discovery of Earth's Earliest Fossils*. Princeton
608 University Press, Princeton, NJ.
609
- 610 Schopf, J.W. & Packer, B.M. 1987. Early Archean (3.3 Billion to 3.5 Billion-Year-Old)
611 microfossils from Warrawoona Group, Australia, *Science*, **237**, 70-73.
612
- 613 Schopf, J.W. & Walter, M.R. 1983. Archean microfossils: new evidence of ancient microbes.
614 In: Schopf, J.W. (ed.) *Earth's Earliest Biosphere, its Origin and Evolution*, Princeton
615 University Press, New Jersey, 214-239.
616
- 617 Seilacher, A. 1967. Bathymetry of trace fossils. *Marine Geology*, **5**, 413-428.
618
- 619 Seilacher, A., Bose, P.K. & Pfluger, F. 1998. Triploblastic animals more than 1 Billion years
620 ago: Trace fossil evidence from India. *Science*, **282**, 80-83
621
- 622 Sepkoski, J.J. 1981. A factor analytic description of the Phanerozoic marine fossil record.
623 *Paleobiology*, **7**, 36-53.
624
- 625 Simpson, G.G. 1944. *Tempo and Mode in Evolution*. New York: Columbia University Press.
626
- 627 Thompson, d'A.W. 1917. *On Growth and Form*. Cambridge University Press.
628
- 629 Tyler, S.A. & Barghoorn, E.S. 1954. Occurrence of structurally preserved plants in Pre-
630 Cambrian rocks of the Canadian Shield. *Science*, **119**, 606-608.
631
- 632 Van Kranendonk, M.J. 2012. A chronostratigraphic division of the Precambrian: possibilities
633 and challenges. In: Gradstein, F.M., Ogg, J.G., Schmitz, M. & Ogg, G. (eds.) *The*
634 *Geologic Time Scale 2012*, Elsevier, Amsterdam, p.299-392.
635

- 636 Van Kranendonk, M.J., Hickman, A.H., Williams, I.R. & Nijman, W. 2001. Archaean
 637 geology of the East Pilbara granite-greenstone terrane Western Australia – a field
 638 guide. *Western Australia Geological Survey Record*, **9/2001**, 134p.
 639
- 640 Wacey, D., Kilburn, M.R., McLoughlin, N., Parnell, J., Stoakes, C.A. & Brasier, M.D. 2008.
 641 Use of NanoSIMS in the search for early life on Earth: ambient inclusion trails in a
 642 c.3400 Ma sandstone. *Journal of the Geological Society of London*, **165**, 43-53.
 643
- 644 Wacey, D., Kilburn, M.R., Saunders, M., Cliff, J.B. & Brasier, M.D. 2011. Microfossils of
 645 sulphur-metabolizing cells in 3.4 billion year old rocks of Western Australia. *Nature*
 646 *Geoscience*, **4**, 698-702.
 647
- 648 Wacey, D., Menon, L.R, Green, L., Gerstmann, D., Kong, C., Mcloughlin, N., Saunders, M.
 649 & Brasier, M.D. 2012. Taphonomy of very ancient microfossils from the ~3400 Ma
 650 Strelley Pool Formation and ~1900 Ma Gunflint Formation: New insights using
 651 focused ion beam. *Precambrian Research*, **220-221**, 234-250.
 652
- 653 Wacey, D., Kilburn, M.R., Saunders, M., Cliff, J.B., Kong, C., Barley, M.E. & Brasier, M.D.
 654 2013. Nanoscale analysis of pyritized microfossils reveals differential heterotrophic
 655 consumption in the ~1.9-Ga Gunflint chert. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*
 656 *Science, USA*, **110**, 8020-8024.
 657
- 658 Wacey, D., Saunders, M., Kong, C., Brasier, A. & Brasier, M.D. 2015. 3.46 Ga Apex chert
 659 ‘microfossils’ reinterpreted as chains of carbon-coated phyllosilicate grains. *Gondwana*
 660 *Research*, doi:10.1016/j.gr.2015.07.010.
 661
- 662 Xiao, S., Zhang, Y. & Knoll, A.H. 1998. Three-dimensional preservation of algae and animal
 663 embryos in Neoproterozoic phosphorites. *Nature*, **445**, 198-201.
 664
 665
 666

667

668 **FIGURE CAPTIONS**

669 **Fig 1.** The “envelope of uncertainty”, which captures the time during which the major groups
 670 of life may have originated. The deep time end member represents the origin of the clade if
 671 the oldest claim from the fossil record is to be believed. The late arrivals end member
 672 represents the point in the fossil record by which this clade is certainly recognised and is
 673 uncontested in interpretation.

674

675 **Fig 2.** Examples of continua within apparently biological structures generated by abiogenic
676 processes that produce self-organising structures (SOS). These can arise naturally at
677 interfaces in physico-chemical systems. Symmetry is lost from left to right as morphological
678 complexity increases. Overall SOS size decreases down the figure. With stromatoloids (at a
679 and d) some scientists believe that complex forms (within the ‘domain of biological
680 morphology’) necessitate a biological component. But the full spectrum of forms is found in
681 both biological and abiological stromatoloid systems; both result from the physics of viscous
682 materials and neither result from behaviour of microbes alone. In well preserved confirmed
683 microfossil assemblages, the morphological variation is usually less than in co-occurring
684 abiogenic structures (at e–h) and so occupies a more restricted domain within the
685 morphospace (from Brasier *et al.* 2006).

686

687 **Fig 3.** Application of imaging techniques to the analysis of putative Precambrian
688 microfossils. (a) Type thin section of the 3.46 Ga Apex chert imaged using *Automontage*,
689 revealing complex branching (arrows) of a microstructure once interpreted to be a microfossil
690 (inset shows original sketch of the ‘microfossil’ from Schopf (1993)). (b) Light microscope
691 image of a second microfossil-like object from the Apex chert. (c) 3D model (from FIB-SEM
692 data) of the carbonaceous component of the microfossil-like object, shown in the same
693 orientation as (b). (d) 3D model rotated to show a clear branch (arrow) that is hidden from
694 view in the light microscope image. (e) Scanning TEM image of a cross section through a
695 microfossil-like object from the Apex chert. (f) Elemental map of the boxed area in (e) where
696 carbon is shown in yellow, aluminium (representing vermiculite clay) in green, and iron
697 (representing iron oxides) in red. This shows that the distribution of carbon is incompatible
698 with a chain of cells as previously claimed (Schopf 1993) and the object is actually a

699 pseudofossil created by carbon wrapping around mica-like minerals. Images modified from
 700 Wacey *et al.* (2015).

701

702 **Fig 4.** A conceptual framework for the critical testing of early fossil claims using the ‘cone of
 703 contention’ structure (from Brasier 2015, after Antcliffe and McLoughlin 2008). Fossils
 704 expand in abundance as the fossil record proceeds and as more complex forms emerge. The
 705 favoured null hypothesis will shift with time, with (a–e) illustrating some controversial fossil
 706 candidates of progressively younger age. (a) Approximately 4.0 Ga prokaryote-like structures
 707 from Mars (ALH 84001) (McKay *et al.* 1996) that were challenged by an abiogenic null
 708 hypothesis (Schopf 1999); (b) 3.46 Ga *Archaeosclerolobus disciformis* from the Apex
 709 chert, compared with prokaryotes (Schopf 1999) and later challenged by an abiogenic null
 710 hypothesis (Brasier *et al.* 2002); (c) 1.88 Ga complex microfossil *Eosphaera* from the
 711 Gunflint chert, usually regarded as of problematic affinity (Barghoorn & Tyler 1965) but
 712 suggested to be a eukaryote cell colony (Kazmierczak 1979); (d) approximately 600 Ma
 713 complex microfossil *Megasphaera* from the Doushantuo Formation, whose stem-group
 714 metazoan (animal) embryo interpretation (Xiao *et al.* 1998) has been challenged by a
 715 prokaryote hypothesis (Bailey *et al.* 2007) and a protistan eukaryote hypothesis (Bengtson *et*
 716 *al.* 2012); (e) 560 Ma complex megafossil *Charnia*, long regarded as cnidarian but whose
 717 animal affinities have been questioned (Antcliffe & Brasier 2007); (f) the Carboniferous
 718 crinoid whose biogenicity was at first considered moot by Lister (1673) but is now
 719 interpreted as the remains of an extinct echinoderm (Brasier 2015). Scale bar is 1 μm (a),
 720 40 μm (b), 10 μm (c, d), 30 mm (e).

721

722 **Fig 5.** A collection of drawings of Ediacaran macrofossils made by Martin Brasier in the
 723 course of seeking to better understand the Ediacaran biota. Drawing the specimens in detail

724 provided detailed insights into their morphology. (a) *Vinlandia antecessans*, and (b) *Beothukis*
725 *mistakensis*, from the Conception Group of Newfoundland, Canada. (c) *Charniodiscus*
726 *concentricus* from the Bradgate Formation of Charnwood Forest, U.K. (d) *Dickinsonia*
727 *costata* from the Ediacara Member of the Rawnsley Quartzite, South Australia. (e)
728 *Kimberella quadrata*, a specimen from the White Sea, Russia. (f) *Swartpuntia germsi*,
729 Spitzkopf Member of the Nama Formation, Namibia. (g) *Charnia masoni* (holotype),
730 Bradgate Formation of Charnwood Forest, U.K. At lower right is a summary (*circa* 2004) of
731 the stratigraphic ranges of key Ediacaran taxa (ultimately published in modified form in
732 Brasier & Antcliffe 2004).